



**Norco Assessment Committee  
Minutes for May 11, 2022**

9:00 am-10:30 am  
Zoom

**Meeting Participants**

**Committee Members Present**

Laura Adams, Hayley Ashby, Greg Aycok (co-chair), Courtney Buchanan, Tami Comstock, Eric Doucette, Ashlee Johnson (co-chair), Daren Koch, Stephany Kyriakos, Bibiana Lopez, Timothy Russell, David Schlanger, and Caitlin Welch.

**Committee Members Not Present**

Evangelina Christine Abeyta (student rep.), Dominique Hitchcock, Jethro Midgett, Tim Wallstrom, and Jesus Vela

**Guests**

Lindsay Owens and Aldo Yanez Ruiz

**Recorder**

Charise Allingham

**1. Call to Order**

- 9:04 am

**2. Action Items**

**2.1 Approval of Agenda**

- MSC (Stephany Kyriakos / Eric Doucette)

**2.1 Conclusion**

- Approved by consensus

**2.1 Corrections**

**2.1 Task of**

**2.1 Due by**

Remove 'Business' from AOE Discussion item	Charise	ASAP
--	---------	------

**2.2 Approval of April 6, 2022, Minutes**

- MSC (Courtney Buchanan/ Stephany Kyriakos)

**2.2 Conclusion**

- Approved by consensus

**2.3 Approval of the Assessment Report**

- MSC (Stephanie Kyriakos/ Laura Adams)

An overview of the contents of the report was provided.

2020-2021 was a gap year for assessment and was affected by COVID. The report is attached to the minutes.

The committee appreciated the length of the report.

- MSC (Stephanie Kyriakos/ Laura Adams)

## **2.3 Conclusion**

- Approved by consensus

## **3. Discussion Item**

### **3.1 AOE Fine and Applied Arts Discussion**

- AOE Fine and Applied Arts draft report was shared with the committee (Attached)
- This assessment was completed using mapping, this is based on the SLO assessments having results and being mapped to the PLOs.
- Benchmark of benchmarks is the level that indicates students are learning. Default 70%.
- The IE office facilitates the assessment of the AOE's because no area or discipline 'owns' the AOE's.
- The courses that mapped to the AOE and used for this assessment were shared (attached).
- All 4 PLOs met the benchmark (92%-100%).

#### Discussion

- What are you doing in your courses and program that lead to such high achievement?
- PLOs that focus on demonstrating knowledge and applied knowledge were not both attained in past AOE assessments. Suggestion- that the courses in this AOE are skill-based which assists in the attainment of both demonstrating and applying knowledge.
- Study of Art history is completely different from producing art, impressed that attainment of knowledge is high for all types of Art courses, and all courses included in this assessment.
- Benchmark seems low, do we recommend increasing the benchmark? Do we always keep the benchmark at 70%? A suggestion that the disciplines involved in the assessment should make the decision or possibly the Academic Senate for a discussion and recommendation.
  - Who has the authority to update and edit the AOE's, and who should take the lead, and responsibility?
- The Assessment committee could recommend to the involved disciplines to raise the benchmark.
- Is it necessary to raise the benchmark if the goal is to always continuously improve?
  - Raising the benchmark supports documenting and showing a trend of continuous improvement in assessment.
- Suggestion to bring raising the benchmark in this AOE to COM and AWHL Department Meeting for a discussion. Bring this to the subject matter experts.
  - This discussion can also bring awareness to the disciplines involved of their connection to the AOE program.

## **4. Information Items**

#### **4.1 Leading From the Middle**

Members of the LFM team presented a PPT. (attached)

The goal is to make the practice of assessing equitable in real-time. LFM is a sub-group of the Assessment committee to ensure the work continues after the LFM team concludes. LFM is seeking feedback from the committee.

- Request from LFM -Please share this project with your disciplines, and champion and spread awareness of this project.

Questions-

- What disaggregated data would be available on the dashboard? Attainment of the course SLOs broken down by student ethnicity/race, age, gender, etc.
- Will in-person classes be able to participate in this assessment project if paper exams are used in the classroom? The pilot project is working on best practices to help faculty do all kinds of assessments in Canvas.
- Plan is to have best practices and FLEX presentations in Fall 2023.
- LFM will continue to provide updates on the progress of the LFM team to the committee next semester.
- This project is a great example of how this committee is meeting EMP 2025 Objective 8.1: Make program, student, and effectiveness (including assessment) data available, usable, and clear so critical data is visible in real-time.

#### **4.2 Assessment Forms**

Please continue to use assessment forms to submit assessment data. Please do not submit assessments directly to Nuventive. Nuventive is still under construction.

- [Instruction Assessment Form](#)
- [Student Services Assessment](#)

#### **4.3 Area Updates**

This will be a standing information item going forward. This will provide a place on the agenda for any reports or updates from disciplines, student services, library, etc.

#### **4.4 Academic Senate Update**

- Charters are still going through the Academic Senate for approval and will be extended through 2022-2023, we will need to do the Report of Effectiveness next year.
- Although no direction has been given yet, be prepared for in-person meetings in the Fall.
- Run-off election, please vote for VP of the Academic Senate by 5 pm today.
- New way to request funds for professional development and assessment, email went out. The process will be through a form and assisted by the IDS.

#### **5. Good of the Order**

- Cancelling the next assessment drop-in hour, very little use this time of the year.
- Request for training setting up SLO assessment in Canvas.

#### **6. Future Agenda Topics**

- Sub-group Updates

## **7. Adjournment**

- 10:18 am

### **Next Meeting**

Date: September 14th, 2022

Time: 9:30-10:00 am

Location: OC 116 or Zoom (TBD)

2020-  
2021

# Norco College Annual Assessment Report

**ASHLEE JOHNSON | FACULTY ASSESSMENT  
COORDINATOR**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction.....	2
Strategic Planning .....	2
NAC deliverables for the 2020-2021 year:.....	3
Instructional Learning Outcomes Assessment.....	4
Course Level Assessment:.....	4
Program Level Assessment:.....	4
Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADT) Assessment: .....	4
CTE Programs & Certificates Assessment:.....	4
Area of Emphasis Degrees (AOEs) Assessment:.....	5
General Education Assessment:.....	5
Student Services and Library Services Assessment:.....	5

## INTRODUCTION

The 2020-2021 academic year was highly abnormal due to the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic. Many institutional practices experienced a major deviation from standard operating procedure as Riverside Community College District (RCCD) operated under emergency distance education status throughout the year. With this, assessment activities, such as, assessment discussions, committee meetings, workshops, and planning activities were held in a virtual modality.

Another factor that effected assessment that year was the change in NAC faculty leadership. While the Administrative Co-Chair and Classified Professional Representative continued their positions throughout the 2020-2021 academic year a new Assessment Coordinator was appointed beginning Fall 2020. NAC also gained four new members throughout the year which represented a change in one-third of the committee's membership by the year's end.

Additionally, Norco College made an adjustment in the assessment cycle timeline. Historically the college followed a four-year assessment cycle which was expanded to six years during Spring 2017. As a result, the assessment cycle was extended through the end of the 2019-2020 academic year. Then, in Spring 2020, the college elected to postpone the start of the new assessment cycle until Fall 2021 in order to align with Program Review and the accreditation visit cycle. Because of this, the 2020-2021 academic year was designated as a "Gap Year" intended to close gaps in the previous cycle, update strategic processes, and prepare for the coming cycle.

The purpose of the Annual Assessment Report 2020-2021 is to document assessment-related activities completed throughout the 2020-2021 academic year. Traditionally the report is completed annually and made public on the Norco Assessment Committee (NAC) website:

<https://www.norcocollege.edu/committees/assess/Pages/documents.aspx>. Any questions regarding information found in this report can be directed to Ashlee Johnson, Faculty Assessment Coordinator, or Greg Aycock, Dean of Institutional Effectiveness.

## STRATEGIC PLANNING

Norco College made significant improvements to several assessment-related strategic processes. With the recent approval of the 2020-2025 Strategic Planning and Governance Manual (SPGM), the college began the implementation of a new governance plan. As part of these efforts, college committees were asked to evaluate their role, clarify their alignment with institutional goals, and document their purpose, scope, and deliverables in formal charters.

To summarize the approved charter, the purpose of the Assessment Committee is to support and encourage assessment of student learning in all instructional programs, and student and learning support services. When necessary, the Assessment Committee will make recommendations to the Academic Senate to facilitate improvements in the assessment process and in student learning overall.

The Assessment Committee is primarily responsible for assessing and coordinating the listed Educational Master Planning objectives below: 2030 Goal 8: (Effectiveness, Planning, and Governance) Develop institutional effectiveness and integrated planning systems and governance structures to support ongoing development and continuous improvement as we become a comprehensive college. • 2025 Objective 8.1 Make program, student, and effectiveness (including assessment) data available, usable, and clear so critical data is visible in real time. Our role is to assess student learning and support and guide improvements in pedagogy and practices that will result in closing student learning gaps.

#### **NAC DELIVERABLES FOR THE 2020-2021 YEAR:**

1. Create committee charter and submit to Academic Senate for approval.
2. Provide support and input on data to be integrated into the new Program Review platform
3. Develop a framework for integrating SLO assessment in Canvas.
4. Map SLOs to PLOs/GELOs in Nuventive.

NAC began working towards deliverable 1 in early Fall 2020 at the initial committee meeting held on September 9, 2020 with a review of accomplishments and areas for improvement from the previous year. The review helped to close the gap on previous efforts and encourage progress in the new year. A discussion on the committee's strategic alignment with institutional goals was also initiated at the first meeting. The discussion on continued throughout the next month and re-surfaced at the October 14, 2020 meeting along with a discussion on the draft charter. In December 2020, after several months of collaboration, NAC approved the charter and submitted it to the academic senate for approval which signaled the completion of deliverable 1.

The committee also made progress towards Deliverable 2 during Fall 2020. Several discussions and brainstorming activities were held to determine which data should be provided to best support a meaningful analysis in the assessment section of Program Review. NAC also engaged in activities to determine which methods, tools and technologies would best display the selected datasets in a user-friendly way.

Prior to the launch of program review, NAC supported the Nuventive development team by providing feedback and recommendations on assessment-



related platform design. NAC also helped develop assessment prompts, an assessment review rubric, and dashboards for the new program review process. Once the development of the new process was finalized, NAC held workshops, developed trainings, and participated in scoring the assessment-related sections of Program Review. This process took the remainder of the academic year. The last two deliverables were postponed until the next academic year.

## **INSTRUCTIONAL LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT**

Postponing the new cycle of assessment until Fall 2021 provided an additional year to assess outcomes that were not assessed the previous cycle. Faculty were encouraged to continue assessing outcomes throughout the academic year, as they deemed professionally applicable. Completed assessments were credited to the previous cycle. Additionally, unassessed courses continued to be tracked using the assessment tracking dashboards and made public on the assessment website. Being in the middle of a pandemic at the time, many disciplines elected not to continue assessing student learning outcomes during this time in order to focus their efforts towards quality instruction in the unconventional online environment. Several faculty members also expressed concern that assessment results may be skewed by the confounding variables introduced by chaos from the COVID 19 pandemic. A summary of the outcomes assessed during Fall 2020 to Spring 2021 academic year follows.

### **COURSE LEVEL ASSESSMENT:**

An additional 48 SLOs from 11 courses were assessed during the Fall 2020 to Spring 2021 academic year.

### **PROGRAM LEVEL ASSESSMENT:**

No additional PLOs were assessed during the Fall 2020 to Spring 2021 academic year.

### **ASSOCIATE DEGREES FOR TRANSFER (ADT) ASSESSMENT:**

No additional ADT outcomes were assessed during the Fall 2020 to Spring 2021 academic year.

### **CTE PROGRAMS & CERTIFICATES ASSESSMENT:**

No additional CTE outcomes were assessed during the Fall 2020 to Spring 2021 academic year.

However, 100% of CTE programs completed assessment of at least one PLO by end of Fall 2019.

### **AREA OF EMPHASIS DEGREES (AOES) ASSESSMENT:**

In Fall 2020 discussion workshops were held for each of the AOEs that had been assessed in Fall 2019. During these workshops, a data summary for each of the AOE Program Learning Outcomes were shared and discussed in an attempt to answer the 'so what' question. The final AOE reports including the assessment summary and discussion can be found on the Assessment Committee Website:

- [Fine & Applied Arts 2019](#)
- [Business Administration & Information Systems 2019](#)
- [Math and Science 2019](#)
- [Humanities, Philosophy & Arts 2019](#)
- [Kinesiology, Health, and Wellness 2019](#)
- [Social & Behavioral Studies 2019](#)
- [Communications, Media & Languages 2019](#)

### **GENERAL EDUCATION ASSESSMENT:**

No additional GELOs were assessed during the Fall 2020 to Spring 2021 academic year. However, 100% of GELOs were assessed at least one time during the previous cycle.

### **STUDENT SERVICES AND LIBRARY SERVICES ASSESSMENT:**

Support Services assessment is conducted throughout the assessment cycle and utilized to make data-driven decisions. At the close of each cycle, assessment data is then summarized and used to make resource requests during Program Review. The data is then archived in a document repository in Nuventive for future use.

Student Service assessment for the 2018-2021 cycle was organized into five programs, Advising and Counseling, Enrollment Services, Equity Programs, Special Programs, and Student Life. According to document archives in Nuventive, 100% of SS program units completed assessment within at least one of their respective service areas during the 2018-2021 cycle. However, collaboration between NAC and SS Professionals indicated a need to further define SS programs and service areas and update the Nuventive platform to improve the assessment process in the future.

Additionally, as a result of assessment planning activities, the college identified a need to establish independent assessment units for Library Services in the coming cycle. As a result, the role of NAC in the area of Student Services and Library Services was greatly improved. The groups collaborated to update the assessment process, to improve quality, and align assessment practices throughout the institution. The initiative began with an evaluation of historical practices and identification of areas for improvement. NAC then hosted a support services assessment training series to align understanding and support professional development. The training series provided an overview of the assessment process at Norco College, offered tools to help support assessment activities, and facilitated assessment process improvements. Additionally, the groups began to update their assessment units and outcomes in preparation of the coming cycle.

Beginning in 2021, the Area of Emphasis (AOE) degrees will assess Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) through the mapping of course Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) to PLOs. This is done through Nuventive Improve through the following process (include visuals):

1. The Institutional Effectiveness office assigns courses to the AOE program using the required and elective courses identified in the College Catalog.
2. Assigned discipline faculty use the matrix in Nuventive to map Course Student Learning Outcomes (SLO) to AOE Program Learning Outcomes (PLO).

AOE - ART: Fine & Applied Arts		AHS-01 - History of Western Art: Prehistoric, Ancient, and Med... * is owned by another Unit(Discipline - AHS)			
PLOs	SLO 1 Identify, describe and discuss art in its historical context.	SLO 2 Critique, compare and contrast various artists, artworks and styles.	SLO 3 Describe, analyze and discuss the styles of various cultures, historical periods, medi...	SLO 4 Articulate their ideas concerning art through the use of appropriate art terminology in	
PLO 1 Demonstrate basic knowledge and skills (technique) in one discipline of the fine and applied arts. These include fundamentals of the field in ter ...	✓	✓	✓	✓	
PLO 2 Develop a personal vision and/or purpose--sometimes called "artistic voice"--that is evident in terms of work produced and manifested in a ...			✓	✓	
PLO 3 Generate and apply original ideas and methods to discover, create and communicate specific artistic content.	✓	✓	✓	✓	
PLO 4 Demonstrate conceptual acuity, clarity, imagination, and technical ability to combine, integrate, and synthesize elements into works in ...					

3. Reports of mapped SLO benchmark attainment are pulled from Nuventive.

Course ID	Course Name	SLO Name	SLO	Benchmark Met	SLO Status
AHS-01	History of Western Art: Prehistoric, Ancient, and	SLO 1	Identify, describe and discuss art in its historical context.		Active
		SLO 2	Critique, compare and contrast various artists, artworks and styles.	Yes	Active
		SLO 3	Describe, analyze and discuss the styles of various cultures, historical periods, media, techniques, artworks, and artists and formulate these observations and evaluations into written form.	Yes	Active
		SLO 4	Articulate their ideas concerning art through the use of appropriate art terminology in both written form and class	Yes	Active

Mastery of PLOs is assessed by taking the average of mapped SLOs that have met benchmarks. This average, is then compared to the benchmark set for PLOs (also known as the benchmark of benchmarks). The default benchmark of benchmarks is set at 70%, however, this can be changed if deemed necessary by the various disciplines involved in the AOE or by the Norco Assessment Committee.

In Fall 2021, all PLOs for the Fine and Applied Arts AOE degree were assessed using the method described above. SLO assessment from Fall 2014 to Spring 2021 was used for the assessment of all PLOs.

The following were the assessment outcomes for PLOs 1-4:

	# of Courses Mapped	# of Courses with Assessment	# of SLO Assessments	% SLO Assessments meeting Benchmarks	Benchmark of Benchmarks
<b>PLO 1 - Demonstrate basic knowledge and skills (technique) in one discipline of the fine and applied arts. These include fundamentals of the field in terms of practice, history, analysis and their applications and technical ability in one discipline to create, sustain and evolve a personal vision and/or purpose.</b>	20	14	55	95%	70%
<b>PLO 2 - Develop a personal vision and/or purpose-- sometimes called "artistic voice"--that is evident in terms of work produced and manifested in a portfolio, performance, exhibition, or other presentation.</b>	20	12	23	100%	70%
<b>PLO 3 - Generate and apply original ideas and methods to discover, create and communicate specific artistic content.</b>	19	12	53	92%	70%
<b>PLO 4 - Demonstrate conceptual acuity, clarity, imagination, and technical ability to combine, integrate, and synthesize elements into works in ways that enhance their communicative powers.</b>	14	8	17	100%	70%

Clearly with a range of 92%-100% of SLO assessments meeting benchmarks and a PLO benchmark of benchmark at 70%, students seem to be achieving the program outcomes for the Fine and Applied Arts AOE.

These outcomes were discussed at the Norco Assessment Committee on

Beginning in 2021, the Area of Emphasis (AOE) degrees will assess Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) through the mapping of course Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) to PLOs. This is done through Nuventive Improve through the following process (include visuals):

1. The Institutional Effectiveness office assigns courses to the AOE program using the required and elective courses identified in the College Catalog.
2. Assigned discipline faculty use the matrix in Nuventive to map Course Student Learning Outcomes (SLO) to AOE Program Learning Outcomes (PLO).

AOE - ART: Fine & Applied Arts		AHS-01 - History of Western Art: Prehistoric, Ancient, and Med... * is owned by another Unit(Discipline - AHS)			
PLOs	SLO 1 Identify, describe and discuss art in its historical context.	SLO 2 Critique, compare and contrast various artists, artworks and styles.	SLO 3 Describe, analyze and discuss the styles of various cultures, historical periods, medi...	SLO 4 Articulate their ideas concerning art through the use of appropriate art terminology in	
PLO 1 Demonstrate basic knowledge and skills (technique) in one discipline of the fine and applied arts. These include fundamentals of the field in ter ...	✓	✓	✓	✓	
PLO 2 Develop a personal vision and/or purpose--sometimes called "artistic voice"--that is evident in terms of work produced and manifested in a ...			✓	✓	
PLO 3 Generate and apply original ideas and methods to discover, create and communicate specific artistic content.	✓	✓	✓	✓	
PLO 4 Demonstrate conceptual acuity, clarity, imagination, and technical ability to combine, integrate, and synthesize elements into works in ...					

3. Reports of mapped SLO benchmark attainment are pulled from Nuventive.

Course ID	Course Name	SLO Name	SLO	Benchmark Met	SLO Status
AHS-01	History of Western Art: Prehistoric, Ancient, and	SLO 1	Identify, describe and discuss art in its historical context.		Active
		SLO 2	Critique, compare and contrast various artists, artworks and styles.	Yes	Active
		SLO 3	Describe, analyze and discuss the styles of various cultures, historical periods, media, techniques, artworks, and artists and formulate these observations and evaluations into written form.	Yes	Active
		SLO 4	Articulate their ideas concerning art through the use of appropriate art terminology in both written form and class	Yes	Active

Mastery of PLOs is assessed by taking the average of mapped SLOs that have met benchmarks. This average, is then compared to the benchmark set for PLOs (also known as the benchmark of benchmarks). The default benchmark of benchmarks is set at 70%, however, this can be changed if deemed necessary by the various disciplines involved in the AOE or by the Norco Assessment Committee.

In Fall 2021, all PLOs for the Fine and Applied Arts AOE degree were assessed using the method described above. SLO assessment from Fall 2014 to Spring 2021 was used for the assessment of all PLOs.

The following were the assessment outcomes for PLOs 1-4:

	# of Courses Mapped	# of Courses with Assessment	# of SLO Assessments	% SLO Assessments meeting Benchmarks	Benchmark of Benchmarks
<b>PLO 1 - Demonstrate basic knowledge and skills (technique) in one discipline of the fine and applied arts. These include fundamentals of the field in terms of practice, history, analysis and their applications and technical ability in one discipline to create, sustain and evolve a personal vision and/or purpose.</b>	20	14	55	95%	70%
<b>PLO 2 - Develop a personal vision and/or purpose-- sometimes called "artistic voice"--that is evident in terms of work produced and manifested in a portfolio, performance, exhibition, or other presentation.</b>	20	12	23	100%	70%
<b>PLO 3 - Generate and apply original ideas and methods to discover, create and communicate specific artistic content.</b>	19	12	53	92%	70%
<b>PLO 4 - Demonstrate conceptual acuity, clarity, imagination, and technical ability to combine, integrate, and synthesize elements into works in ways that enhance their communicative powers.</b>	14	8	17	100%	70%

Clearly with a range of 92%-100% of SLO assessments meeting benchmarks and a PLO benchmark of benchmark at 70%, students seem to be achieving the program outcomes for the Fine and Applied Arts AOE.



These outcomes were discussed at the Norco Assessment Committee on

# LFM TEAM UPDATE

DR. DOMINIQUE HITCHCOCK

DR. HAYLEY ASHBY

ASHLEE JOHNSON

LISA MARTIN

TOREN WALLACE

CHARISE ALLINGHAM



**NORCO**  
COLLEGE



## OUR WHY:

Our current assessment process is failing students by neglecting to consider disaggregated student learning data.

## OUR WHAT:

Develop a process to assess SLOs using Canvas Gradebook and integrate Canvas and Nuventive.

## OUR HOW:

To use data disaggregated by equity groups as the cornerstone of student learning assessment to close equity gaps and support decision-making at the College.

## OUR CALL TO ACTION:

Commit to recognizing and addressing racial inequities and contribute to a change of culture at all levels of the institution.



**NORCO**  
COLLEGE

# WHERE WE ARE

Goal: Institutionalize a practice of using student learning outcome (SLO) and service area outcome (SAO) disaggregated data to support pedagogy, improvement, decisions, resource allocation, and continuous improvement.

Where we are:

- Pre-Pilot: LFM Team members assess in Canvas and develop a standard rubric
- Training: Working with district Interim Dean of Distance Education to obtain formal Canvas Outcomes training from Instructor for LFM team and NAC members
- Research: Coordination with Nuventive to answer questions and check on Security Certificate status
- Outreach: Reaching out to Mt. SAC for information on their integration of Canvas/Nuventive
- Communication: LFM Team members will present to college committees in April

# ANTICIPATED NEEDS:

